CATTLE RUSTLING AND INSECURITY IN AFRICA: A COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVE

Introduction

Cattle rustling is on the rise in various African countries, with the associated number of deaths, both amongst cattle rustlers, security forces and affected populations reaching problematic proportions. Yet, there is limited policy-oriented research on this matter ranging the security-development continuum. This brief draws on existing literature, and provides an overview of cattle rustling in Madagascar, Lesotho, South Africa, Uganda, Nigeria and Kenya. A brief contextualisation is provided for each country, before outlining the security measures implemented to tackle the challenge, and deriving recommendations.

Historically, the drivers of cattle rustling can be found in cultural and socio-economic roots, but more recently the practice has become a large-scale criminal activity, with strong security implications, and with direct and indirect effects on the groups involved. The raiders have different rationales of engagement in the activity, with some relating to economic survival in times of hardship, whilst others connected to conflict entrepreneurship, entailing living off raids through heavily armed activities. This criminal activity is also affected by the dynamics in the security sector, with members of the security forces sometimes engaging or providing cover for rustling, being often conducted to the benefit of powerful political and business figures. The links between raiders, security forces, business circles and political elites vary depending on the country’s particular dynamics. Despite this intrinsically local connection, channels for selling stolen cattle or processing meat are often embedded in the national meat industry, and in transnational flows of goods, crossing borders and involving market-driven international actors.

From a human security perspective cattle rustling has wide ranging negative effects. Direct violence often accompanies raids, which can result in substantial loss of lives and displacement of populations, and it can contribute indirectly to further violence through the spread of small arms and light weapons (SALW), as herders arm themselves to protect their cattle and organised criminal groups increase their weaponry. It affects the livelihoods of pastoral communities as the “cash reserves” that cattle herds represent disappear. At a macro level, leads to decline in economic activity or in the potential for agriculture to contribute to the country’s economy.

The human security dimension provides for areas of intersection with security sector reform (SSR), insofar as the effectiveness of the security forces in addressing the criminal phenomenon, whilst at the same time doing so using force proportionally, and complying with human rights standards.
of non-state security provision which SSR ought to address.

1. **Madagascar’s Dahalo**

![Figure 26: High cost of inputs, inadequate land area and low selling prices are top three constraints to agriculture by community groups](source: WB staff calculations using EPM 2010)

Cattle rustling has been receiving growing attention in Madagascar, with increasing turn to the police and/or the gendarmerie for protection, given the widespread fear of the raiders. Unemployment, poverty and environmental pressures have contributed to the rise of cattle raiding, i.e. the “dahalo” phenomenon. It is now depicted as an organised criminal activity, often involving hundred-strong bands of raiders, and as a result, the World Bank notes that cattle theft is the sixth most important constraint to agricultural development in the country.

The effects of cattle rustling on the life standards of the pastoral population are aggravated by stress factors. Agricultural production has, overall, increased, but has not kept up with population growth, leading to a surplus of labour and a land shortage. Agriculture in Madagascar is also below comparable sub-Saharan standards in its contribution to GDP growth, and is subject to increased volatility and climate unpredictability. The combination of these factors lessens household resilience to external shocks with a reduction of the safety net represented by cattle, and increases sensitivity to the loss of cattle heads.

The trade in cattle theft is reportedly facilitated by the corruption at various institutional levels that renders inefficient any cattle control measures. The regulatory process involves the check of a ID card for the cow (Fiche Identitaire Bovin), a cattle passport, approval from the rural delegate, and vaccination records, with discrepancies flagging stolen cattle, but false papers are easily generated. Local administrations, responsible for several of these administrative tasks, tend to be underfunded, reflecting general challenges of the Malagasy state institutions.

Aside corruption, the reach and capacity of the state are called into question. A durable political crisis has eroded the ability of state forces to reach the countryside adequately, and to control theft-related violence and insecurity. A result is that some parts of the security forces are enmeshed with criminal networks, and that durable export chains are
Traditional systems such as the ‘dina’ provide measures to address cattle rustling, through a community mode of judgement and award of reparations.

2. Lesotho

Livestock theft is a long-standing issue in Lesotho. Its perpetrators are not solely poor and/or unemployed individuals, but can also be large, organised criminal groups. Cattle rustling puts substantial pressure on rural livelihoods and, at a more general scale, on capacities for investment (e.g. in human capital) and hence on prospects of development. Cattle theft is on broader terms an economic and human security issue, as it leads to impoverishment and is associated with direct violence.

Measures

everal strategies have been employed to counter the challenge. A long standing approach involved the police and the local communities in a “local partnership”. Community policing was put into practice with direct involvement of community chiefs, responsible for nominating the individuals joining the programmes, and training provided

built on cattle theft, with meat exported to nearby islands or to countries further East.

Measures

In response to the dahalo phenomenon, a current trend of reassertion of the state’s military capacity with regards to cattle theft is noticeable. The anti-dahalo special unit (Unité spéciale anti-dahaloUSAD) benefits from advanced equipment, but its operations have been marred by exactions and not necessarily successful. The links between the security services and the criminal groups also account for this trend, as the groups are sometimes headed by former members of the military or other security forces. When sent to catch dahalo, security forces tend to kill them rather than have them appear in court and potentially testify to those connections.

Amnesty measures have been undertaken from 2013 onwards. The process has had a positive impact on immediate security and has led some former dahalo members to turn on their earlier activity. The process is based on a sequential logic, and needs to be followed by socio-economic measures that are difficult to foresee given the current economic circumstances, running the risk to increase frustrations and stem the reintegration processes.

Furthermore, traditional systems such as the dina provide measures to address cattle rustling, through a community mode of judgement and award of reparations, providing for quick reimbursements to the owners of stolen cattle. The mechanism is diverse and found at different levels (from the village to the region), and the approval of the corresponding government administrators can formalise its decisions. The dina system also accounts for some forms of self-defence and popular militias that can quickly exceed legal limits, particularly where state control is weak.

Improving the administration and functioning of the meat industry, and targeting the distribution and sale of cattle form an additional angle to addressing cattle rustling. An important link in the chain rests on the absorption of stolen cattle in legitimate circuits. In Madagascar, the “grands patrons” in particular are able to buy stolen heads at discount rates and direct them to markets, while transnational buyers ship processed meat outwards from Madagascar’s coasts. The involvement of high-ranking individuals in the cattle theft chain can also run counter some of the measures to stem the phenomenon, and notably puts brakes on dina measures.
Community policing and stock theft associations or crime prevention committees experienced coordination and organization problems, with a lack of clear mandates and communication problems. Moreover, intimidation and violence by stock raiders rendered community patrols inefficient and dangerous, while the ability to gather information was hampered by the links of thieves with different committees. The more traditional security patrols were confronted with material problems in communications, arms and ammunition, and transportation. As a result, they often arrived too late to scenes of raiding or could be outgunned by raiders. More generally, the issue of corruption and linkages between stock raiders, policemen and community chiefs is an impediment to addressing cattle rustling in Lesotho.25

Aside from policing, there were also initiatives to tackle the judicial dimension of cattle rustling in Lesotho. Livestock theft was as of 2005 a responsibility in first instance of subordinate courts and magistrate courts. Problems at the investigation stage lead to improper or insufficient evidence and hence, to uneven sentencing or early acquittal. The slowness of investigation and prosecution contributed to both prison overcrowding (given long custodies) and early acquittals in matters of cattle theft. Moreover, stock theft requires great expertise, found in Lesotho in the High Court but lacking at lower levels. Problems of understaffing are accompanied by technical hindrances in the storage of evidence, exhibits, and records.26

3. South Africa

In South Africa, there is also some evidence that livestock theft is on the increase in the last years. Although the number of cases reported is slowly decreasing, the number of livestock stolen has increased from 2005 onwards to levels in 2011/12 that are similar to those of the end of the 90s.

![Figure 1: Number of cases reported versus number of livestock stolen. (Clack 2013, p83)](image)

Similarly to other countries, there is an evolution of the phenomenon from a survival practice (named “potslagting”) to a criminal organised enterprise. Contrary to other countries however, the phenomenon seems better handled by the police, as recovery rates are higher (from 23 percent recovery rate for sheep to 42.95 per cent for cattle).27 The issue takes mostly an economic form, and is
Community policing initiatives claim some success given their ability to react to emergencies and contact law enforcement institutions. They also have intimate knowledge of the cattle routes and of cross-border flows. These activities come at a substantial financial cost and the involvement and coordination of widespread farming communities.

Finally, international initiatives seek to address the phenomenon at a national level. The Southern African Regional Conference on Stock Theft
was held in 2002 with the six Secretariat of the Southern African Regional Police Chiefs Cooperation Organisation (SARPCCO) countries. The conference stressed the improvement of training and communications, the harmonisation of the countries’ legislation on the identification of stock, and the use of technologies such as DNA to combat cattle theft. 35 The National Rural Safety Conference of 2001 brought attention on the socio-economic aspects of stock theft, more particularly by advocating mitigation measures for subsistence farmers affected by the issue.36

4. Karamoja in Uganda

The Karamoja Cluster is spread across the countries of Uganda, Kenya, Ethiopia and Sudan. It has been singled out for years for violent cattle rustling, a phenomenon that straddles the borders. The dynamics are however not homogeneous for each country, hence they will be addressed in turn. The Karamoja region in Uganda used to be the focus of most of the research. Coupled with a relative worsening of the situation in some of the neighbouring countries (South Sudan and Kenya notably), a recent decrease in violence levels has led to a shift in research focus.37

The region was amongst the poorest and most violent parts of the country for a long time, and home to the conflict with the Lord’s Resistance Army. Similar to other countries, cattle rustling in Uganda had been increasingly violent in the 2000s. The practice of small-scale cultural or survival cattle theft evolved in a professionalised, business-like practice, while the spread of SALW and conflict dynamics in the region heightened substantially the violence levels associated to the practice.

Widespread, easy access to SALW were one of the main drivers for the lethality related to cattle rustling. Uganda’s efforts at disarmament have had a substantial impact on controlling the security aspects of the issue. It was difficult to implement the disarmament programme in the earlier years, with different groups in Karamoja vying for local domination over each other.38 Some years later, the disarmament programme is widely credited with bringing down the proliferation of illicit SALW and diminishing the overall violence levels.39 A key factor in this evolution appears to be the effective provision of security by the Ugandan state, which was lacking in the early years. Cattle raiding has not completely disappeared however. Within the region, some groups still engage in the activity, while groups that used to migrate seasonally across the national borders into the neighbouring countries now follow shorter routes and stay in Uganda.40

Given the cross border nature of cattle rustling in the Karamoja cluster, there have been regional security initiatives. The Nairobi Protocol on the Prevention, Control and Reduction of Small Arms and Light Weapons in the Great Lakes Region, the Horn of Africa and Bordering States of 2004 focuses specifically on SALW control efforts, while the Intergovernmental Authority on Development (IGAD) monitors conflicts.

Given the cross border nature of cattle rustling in the Karamoja cluster, there have been regional security initiatives.
The weak control of the state over north-western Kenya has facilitated the emergence of cattle warlords relying on armed militias.

and assists pastoralist communities with its Drought Disaster Resilience and Sustainability Initiative. Persistent drought and a reduction in rangelands put stress in the pastoral system, providing alternative livelihoods and improving the resilience of pastoral communities through such initiatives is a complement to the disarmament efforts.

The East Africa Police Chiefs Cooperation Organization (EAPCCO) Protocol on the Prevention, Combating and Eradication of Cattle Rustling in Eastern Africa (2008) puts forth harmonising measures for the legislation related to cattle rustling and for livestock identification systems and records (art. 6 and 7). Moreover, it proposes “to improve the capacity of police, customs, border guards, the judiciary, communities, local leaders and other relevant agencies,” to undertake combined operations, provide mutual legal assistance, cooperate in law enforcement, and to involve the civil society in addressing the issue of cattle rustling (art 7-12). However, it had not come into force by early 2016.

5. Kenya

Cattle rustling is reported to also be a custom among cattle rearing communities in Kenya. It especially occurs during the dry season when there is limited pasture and water, increasing competition. The approach used is similar to the theft elsewhere, and revenge attacks tend to follow, furthering the cycle. In present-day Kenya cattle rustling has been transformed from a customary means of livestock restocking with traditional weapons such as bows and spears to a commercial practice where sophisticated weaponry is used. In the last two decades a number of pastoral societies have become militarised and increasingly rely on firearms. New forms of banditry and cattle rustling have emerged, over which the elders have less control, and displacements resulting from cattle rustling and pastoral community conflicts became a humanitarian problem in the country. The weak control of the state over north-western Kenya has facilitated the emergence of cattle warlords relying on armed militias to protect their interests and the violence associated with cattle rustling has political consequences, and is increasingly used to affect administrative boundaries. 41

Measures

Cattle rustling is a criminal activity that directly relates to the spread of illicit arms and light weapons. The EAPCCO Protocol on Prevention, Combating and Eradication of Cattle Rustling in Eastern Africa (2008) would also be relevant for Kenya, but awaits implementation. Meanwhile, EAPCCO has undertaken the Mifugo Project (mifugo is the Kiswahili word for livestock), in partnership with the Nairobi Office of the Institute for Security Studies (ISS), which focused on small arms from a cattle-rustling perspective and related criminal activities. The project was aimed at raising public awareness on the problem, and it provided a unique legal approach to the issue by adding a juridical status to the traditional structures dealing with cattle rustling. The dialogue between EAPCCO and those traditional structures has also resulted in the establishment of a system for record tracking and marking of cattle, however the project was discontinued due to lack of funds.

Currently, a system of peace committees has been established at local and national levels under the National Steering Committee, and
The disarmament processes failed to consider the fact that the community did not only use weapons as a mean of defence, but also to increase their fighting capability. In those cases, mediation between representatives from the state and the community are crucial to prevent an escalation of violence.

The National Peace Building and Conflict Management Policy (2009). The peace committees are multi-stakeholder bodies that include law enforcement agencies, provincial administrations, traditional leaders, parliamentarians and civil society representatives.

The government deployed a General Service Unit (GSU); an Anti Stock Theft Unit (ASTU); Administrative Police (AP) and Regular Police in five trading centres along the Kerio valley with the responsibility of providing security to the communities and their properties. However, security officers lacked coordination when the raids occurred, and questions also emerged around their use of force against raiders, who were common citizens.

Other approaches to addressing cattle rustling focus on disarmament, voluntary or forced, especially in the North Rift region. However, those programmes have proven to be inefficient for several reasons. First, they have left communities vulnerable to attacks from other clans, and incited hatred towards the security forces. Secondly, forceful disarmament also led the raiders to upgrade their initial weapons into more sophisticated ones. Thirdly, collusion between the raiders and the regional parliamentarians that needed to prevent prosecution procedures for the raiders in order to safeguard their positions was also admitted. The disarmament process was not thorough enough to consider the full effects on the community.

Another avenue is linked to peace dialogue between local leaders, district administrators, kraal leaders, local security chiefs, civil society and community meetings to discuss causes and effects of cattle rustling. To be successful, leaders of all sides need to be involved, including spiritual leaders (Laibons), given the need of terrain knowledge and rural connections to efficiently conduct raids.

6. Nigeria

In Nigeria cattle rustling has also evolved in the past decades into a militarised criminal activity fuelled by the proliferation of SALW, and the availability of hideouts in the country’s forests. The phenomenon is particularly prevalent in the north and contributes to the dynamics of insecurity in that region.

Measures

The Nigerian Police Force launched in 2014 a specialised Task Force on Cattle Rustling and Associated Crime, and northern state governors have attempted to coordinate action between the police, the military, and other state security services, but without much effect. Neighbouring Niger implemented a more fruitful initiative (“Operation Sharan Daji”) which brought together “the military, police, security service, civil defence corps, and local vigilante groups” to directly confront the rustlers in the forest. The initiative showed promising results and inspired the Nigerian Katsina state to adopt a similar approach.
The tracking of stolen cows using information and communication technologies (ICT) can be a deterrent to cattle rustling.

The use of radio frequency identification tags has also been hailed as a potentially useful technology against cattle raids in Nigeria. The tracking of stolen cows using information and communication technologies (ICT) can be a deterrent to cattle rustling, but requires efficient and timely response by the security forces, or alternative ways to manage the conflict between the rustlers and the victims to be effective.

The use of large-scale community cattle ranches is also seen by some as a way to prevent cattle rustling by concentrating the herds and providing security to all animals in a delimited area.

However, such solution depends on the level of fees and the sanitation situation in particular ranches to be interesting for cattle owners.

7. Aggregated recommendations

The different studies and reports reviewed recommend measures to counter cattle rustling using different but complementary strategies, as per below:

1. Increase material and financial flows to institutions that address cattle rustling. Deficiencies in the equipment of agencies or training of the staff are presented as obstacles to their missions. Measures such as training for anti-stock theft associations, the improvement of communications between the police and communities, roving courts to palliate the weaknesses of the local judicial institutions are seen as potentially valuable in this regard.

2. Arms proliferation makes cattle rustling deadlier and facilitates the militarisation of criminal groups, hence the need to stem the flow of SALWs. Disarmament campaigns have contributed to improving the situation in Uganda, and could be suitable in other countries.

3. Address the economic roots of cattle rustling by improving the livelihood prospects of the population. An improvement of education is advocated given its effects on long-term prospects, in addition to more immediate measures comprising the provision of economic safety nets and the promotion of economic growth.

4. Improve judicial responses to the phenomenon, through adopting two measures. The first relates to ensuring effective sanctions for cattle theft, paralleling the recommendations on the improvement of the material and human capacities of institutions. The second stresses the potential benefits of customary justice systems and their capacity to mediate and involve the parties in negotiations. Broader involvement of traditional approaches and civil society organisations is also advocated for their potential role in
The core of the measures surveyed rests on the capacity of the police to pre-empt and respond to cattle raids, as well as on the general functioning of the criminal justice chain.

5. Address the demand in the cattle rustling chain, by looking at the buyers’ side. For example, involving butchers’ associations can improve knowledge of the cattle market. It is also recommended to investigate the mechanisms that integrate stolen cattle back into legitimate markets, and more generally the entrepreneurial processes that make cattle rustling beneficial for some powerful actors.

6. Use information and communication technologies such as computer microchips or radio frequency identification to achieve better marking and monitoring of livestock. Combined with an improvement in the administrative aspects of sales and ownership registrations, these techniques can improve the surveillance of herds and the tracking of cattle.

Concluding Remarks

The evolution of cattle rustling from a cultural practice associated with rites of passage or with a relatively tolerated subsistence theft to an organised and violent criminal enterprise is consistent across the different cases. Whether cultural traits of cattle raiding are still present and important in society, and whether the evolution of the narrative is affected by idealisation of the past remains unclear. More important is to understand how local community-level forms of governance can contribute to curb the more nefarious forms of cattle rustling. The indication of association between raiders and local figures, enmeshed in political connections in certain cases, reveals the need for detailed knowledge of the national and subnational context to effectively tackle cattle rustling. Moreover, expanding the focus beyond the immediate robbery is important given the trajectory of stolen cattle back into legitimate market channels. The administration of the meat industry is often composed of several administrative levels and numerous institutions, whose functioning affects the dynamics of cattle rustling.

The core of the measures surveyed rests on the capacity of the police to pre-empt and respond to cattle raids, as well as on the general functioning of the criminal justice chain. Without both sectors functioning, advances in markings and identification technologies or in the administrative control of the cattle will be insufficient to tackle the threat. The interconnections of cattle rustling with local dynamics indicate an important third key area, namely the role of traditional authority figures. Engaging with them brings not only local knowledge, but also avenues to engage communities in addressing the phenomenon.

Engaging with traditional authority figures brings not only local knowledge, but also avenues to engage communities in addressing the phenomenon. Conversely, military options
that favour punctual armed incursions often seem to do little to address the roots of the issue. Direct armed responses involve additional violence, and can indirectly increase the militarisation of the criminal groups in an arms race.

While many of the recommendations in the literature remain at the tactical level, oversight mechanisms also need to be put in place, both from formal institutions, based on legal avenues, and from an interaction with communities and traditional leaders and customary modes of control. Such mechanisms can contribute towards prevention of violence at the root, and have a crucial role in overseeing the security forces, and in mediating disputes that arise around cattle theft.

Furthermore, national security strategies and SSR processes need to include analysis of cattle rustling at the strategic level, so as to create an environment conducive to human security, and the needs of the population.

Finally, cattle rustling is often prevalent in border zones. Measures involving different countries are important, especially those marking substantial commitment to address the issue from a regional perspective, including coordination. Such regional agreements have particular force when they involve actors at the operational level and manage to connect institutions of a varied nature to act in a comprehensive manner. This need for coordination is reflected at the subnational level as well, where measures involving the community with the police, and systems to address conflicts and provide reparations can mitigate the impact of cattle rustling.

End Notes

1 Given the difficulty of accessing what are often remote areas (Clack 2013), or the considered low priority since the loss of human life is not always statistically significant.
2 Cattle rustling as cultural practice involved the stealing of one or two bulls as part of rites of passage or to provide for the bride’s price (Bunei, Emmanuel K., Samwel Auya, and Joseph K. Rono, 2016).
3 Kimani, Muiruri John. “Cattle Rustling a Dirty Business”.
7 Id.
8 Myers, supra note 5, at 35.
10 Idem p12-14.
11 Myers, supra note 5.
12 Myers , supra note 5, at 36-7, 47.
15 For example, see Jeune Afrique 2012, RFI Afrique 2015.
16 Pellerin, supra note 34, at 19.
17 Small Arms Survey 2011 Chapter 6 p183.
19 Myers, supra note 5, at 45.
20 Pellerin, supra note 34, at 21.
21 Myers, supra note 5, at 59.
22 Pellerin, supra note 16, at 23.
23 Khoabane, Selloane, and Philip Black. "On the economic effects of livestock theft in Lesotho: An


25 *Id.*, at 26-33 and 66-68.

26 *Id.*, at 27, 33-36.


31 Maluleke, Obioha and Mofokeng, *supra* note 29.

32 Maluleke, Obioha and Mofokeng, *supra* note 29, at 2156.


40 ACTED, *supra* note 37.


